# Report on the Teacher Supply Summit Wellington September 2-3, 2024 and The Education Sector Groups

# Background

A steering group made up of representatives from Council of Deans of Education, Te Herenga Waka Victoria University of Wellington, NZEI Te Riu Roa, Te Akatea and PPTA Te Wehengarua began meeting in 2024 to begin to address teacher supply. Prof Graeme Aitken, ERO and NZ Teaching Council also had input to these meetings.

The steering group considered how to define and highlight the problem of teacher shortage and explored ideas for addressing the problem.

Some initial challenges considered included:

- the reliance on Limited Authority to Teach (LAT) positions to fill gaps
- the need to build our own workforce in the face of declining enrolments in ITE programmes across the country
- the need to tell good stories about teaching
- the fact that the pay and conditions of teachers don't reflect the real work teachers do

There has been a strong commitment to working together in a solutions-focused manner to address the need to: change the perception and reality of teaching (pay, conditions); encourage more people to come into the profession; and to grow and nurture our own workforce rather than rely on expensive recruitment from overseas. To this end, the steering group agreed to hold a summit on Teacher Supply as the first tangible action from this commitment. This document reports back from the summit and is divided into three key sections:

- Executive overview
- Recommendations and actions forward
- Voices of rangatahi
- Key discussions

## Values to underpin the work

- Quality education for all underpinned by Te Tiriti
- Education positioned as an investment rather than a cost
- Children-centric policies
- Profession-led systemic planning
- Teacher agency
- Kotahitang

## **Executive Overview**

About 50 people met for the two-day summit in Wellington on 2-3 September 2024. They represented 18 organisations (Appendix 1) including professional education bodies, teacher unions, education councils, initial teacher education providers, ECE and kindergarten associations, principal organisations and the Ministry of Education.

# Purpose of the Summit

The steering group's purpose was

"To collaboratively formulate solutions for the challenges associated with teacher supply in Aotearoa New Zealand. This group will develop an iterative long-term plan that includes some foundational values and is responsive to contextual evidence."

## The mahi

Dr Therese Ford and Maria Sheridan from Te Akatea facilitated attendees through two busy days. We started with a reflection on ki te kore - ki te  $p\bar{o}$  - ki te ao marama. This was followed by several sessions focussed on the three key phases of teacher supply: recruitment, preparation and education, and retention. These are reported on in detail in the body of the report.

#### **Outcomes of the Summit**

There was consensus that the lack of a national systemic approach to teacher supply and inadequate pay and working conditions are fundamentally the core of the problem. Other issues identified relate to the perceived low status of the profession, lack of clear pathways to career progression, and increasing complexity of teaching<sup>1</sup>. There was also agreement that in addition to shared challenges, each of the three sectors - early childhood, primary, and secondary - faced issues specific to their particular context.

Participants agreed to call on the Government to see Education as an investment not a cost.

The press release (see Appendix 2 for the full text) from the Education Sector Groups contained some helpful statements:

"The right of every child to a quality public education is dependent on a high-quality teaching workforce. The Education Sector Groups agreed there is a chronic and critical shortage of teachers<sup>2</sup> across the early childhood, primary and secondary sectors and there is an immediate need to find a systemic solution to prevent further attrition."

The steering group was set the task of producing a report of the summit for presentation to the Minister at a shorter session in 4-6 weeks. More meetings of the whole group are likely to occur in the future to advance the work programme, including one in early 2025

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> TCANZ (2023) Snapshot of the Teaching Profession.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>https://www.beehive.govt.nz/release/secondary-teachers-moving-new-zealand-fast-tracked-residence

# Recommendations and actions forward

The summit confirmed the kaupapa of the summit:

"To collaboratively formulate solutions for the challenges associated with teacher supply in Aotearoa New Zealand. This group will develop an iterative long-term plan that includes some foundational values and is responsive to contextual evidence."

Robust discussion throughout the two days led to the consensus that there is no one silver bullet to solve the ongoing teacher supply crisis: rather, a systemic-level approach is needed to address the numerous and interrelated issues that feed into the problem.

Organisations present agreed to form as 'Education Sector Groups' (ESG) to address teacher supply.

#### Recommendations

- The summit steering group recommends that an advisory group be established to work
  with the Minister and Ministry of Education to take action on the advice offered by
  Education Sector Groups. The advisory group would comprise members of the Education
  Sector Groups. Funding support and access to MoE data modelling is essential for this
  work.
- 2. On behalf of the ESGs, the steering group will also establish an organisational system to track and monitor the actions agreed by the ESGs. This would cover how summit/wānanga are hosted and by whom, who manages ESG organisation through organisation check-ins and cross-organisation updates.

#### **Actions forward:**

- Developing key messages for media (see starting list below)
- Organisations within the Education Sector Groups to develop their position statement on teacher supply
- Develop a list of important literature about teacher supply
- Explore how staffing entitlement in schools could be an effective lever for change
- Timeline of future wananga and budget commitment to this
- Who will host the next wānanga and lead planning (Term 1, 2025)

#### **Key messages**

This summit has highlighted the following:

- Teaching is undermined and undervalued
- Too much work and not enough pay
- 10 years ago we spent more on Education as a % of GDP than now OECD average is 5.2% ours is around 5.5%
- Education funding not linked to growth in population

#### The Education Sector Groups call for:

- Education and teacher education to be recognised as an investment not a cost
- A Tiriti-led Aotearoa education system that is equitable for all

- Agreement that urgent action is required to address teacher supply
- An acknowledgement that we are the profession and we have the solutions
- A focus on what is working within the Education system

## Voices of rangatahi

A highlight for many was hearing from five rangatahi – three are in their first few years of teaching (primary, secondary), one is an ECE student teacher and one in a secondary ITE programme.

# Panel with Rangatahi

Sharing their thoughts of their journey to becoming a teacher, rangatahi reported they were attracted to teaching as a career because: their parents were teachers; they had a desire to 'be the teacher I wished I had had'; they wanted to be a warrior for social justice and they saw education as the answer to fixing things. Teaching studies provided one rangatahi with a Māori role model and they all agreed that teaching is a secure job where generally you are sheltered from economic recessions and it's a good job if you have a family. They all love working with young people, one liked that they could train locally; and several mentioned they had good teaching models in their own schooling experiences.

When asked what they thought prevents people from applying for initial teacher education courses, the young people mentioned that the cost of re-training and taking on more debt after already completing an undergraduate degree was too much for some; that salaries have not kept up [with other careers] and career-changers can't afford a year without a salary to re-train and ultimately that teaching is 'chosen by those who are passionate but have to take a vow of poverty'. They also mentioned that those contemplating a teaching career needed to be open to growing their Māori cultural competence during the initial teacher education year(s) and subsequently.

When considering the teacher preparation (training) year(s), rangatahi consider that **the most important learning** includes: reflective practice; converting knowledge into effective pedagogy; practicum; Whakawhanaungatanga – getting to know the children; Time in the teaching setting.

- When asked Why do people leave in the first years of teaching?: Go overseas to get money to pay debt; Burnout - huge expectations; Lack of support; Immense workload; Pay; Cultural burnout
- How would you re-set your ITE journey? Increase in scholarships; Paid placements; 4-year teacher training (vs uni system?); Conjoint degrees; Bonding; Great mentors.
- A proportion of all ITE lecturers should have recent experience in the classroom

# **Key Discussions**

Facilitated discussions across the two-day summit provided opportunities for delegates to consider the three phases of teacher supply in groups - namely: Recruitment, Preparation and Education, and Retention. For each phase participants considered the challenges, provided

some possible solutions, and identified the conditions that were required for those solutions to be successful. These are presented in the sections below. Systemic-level considerations were encouraged. Some commonalities across the phases can be seen.

#### Recruitment

A number of negative narratives around teaching were identified as putting off young New Zealanders from choosing teaching as a profession. Solutions focused on changing the narrative, improving the cost of studying to be a teacher, and improving the pay and working conditions. A systemic approach to workforce planning was advocated. Changes to society and to the conditions within the profession were identified as necessary to facilitate solutions.

## Challenges

- Low pay and conditions relative to: high teaching workloads; high cost of teacher education; low status of the profession
- Career changers need to pay for expensive teacher education and then take a drop in pay- this is not a realistic proposition
- Attracting the right people to the profession
- Parents talking their children out of being teachers in favour of more attractive employment options
- Negative stories in the media
- Lack of diversity in applicants: the lack of role models from diverse ethnic backgrounds in early childhood settings and in schools make it difficult to attract a diverse range of quality teachers who reflect the diversity in our schools
- Workplace expectations that kaiako Māori teacher will do everything te ao Māori me te reo Māori and pastoral care for Māori deter applicants
- Unclear career pathways within the profession
- STEM and te reo Māori specialist subject teachers are difficult to recruit due to other industries offering more competitive packages
- Public misunderstanding of the role of ITE and of the Profession

#### Solutions

- Develop a workforce strategy at a national level (grow our own)
- Improve the pay and conditions (which are learning conditions) to uplift the mana of the profession:
  - O Significant pay increase;
  - O appropriate relativity as per world price/ median wages;
  - O more non-contact / prep time;
  - smaller class sizes;
  - O time allowance to recognise the additional responsibilities;
  - O payment and time for mentors
  - O fewer expectations on extra-curricular/ out of hours
  - O Improve promotion processes- change it up! Create pathways to PLD and leadership (not just management) for everyone. Whakamana!
- Change the narrative through:

- A pro-teaching marketing drive that makes the voices that matter heard; positive real stories in the media; marketing campaign – 'Become a teacher'
- A National Roadshow on 'making teaching great again' in the public arena; need to show role models that potential students can aspire to be
- O Positive advocacy publications; it's a job for life
- O Career expos: promoting teaching more in high schools as a career option
- Advertising that reflects diversity
- O Institute transparency around salary levels and progression from before one starts training

#### Fees-free ITE

- O Introduce paid placements<sup>3</sup>; student allowances
- Paid training;
- More scholarships for ITE students
- O More financial support for career changes
- More integrated work ITE programmes that are designed for students to earn and learn
- O Relocation and incentive programmes for 'hard to staff' areas
- O Expand bonding to all teacher education students
- Let the profession lead the profession
- Involve iwi in finding solutions

#### Conditions needed to achieve solutions

- Within the wider society there needs to be:
  - O Awareness that Education is an investment in our Tamariki- mokopuna
  - A large budget for Education
  - Government making trade offs to deliver better pay and conditionsNeed to have fees-free ITE
  - Media championing the profession
  - O Getting communities (importantly parents) on board with any campaigns
  - Need to highlight/demonstrate role models that potential students can aspire to be
  - O Regional heat maps identifying areas of workforce need (e.g. Victoria State \$140/day/urban in training(?) vs \$280 /day/ regional
- Within the profession there needs to be:
  - o Good mentoring when you enter
  - Clear pathways for ongoing growth / development
  - o Career progression across all sectors: ECE, Primary, Secondary
  - Aspiring teachers can gain entry to their ITE provider of choice with the same access to funding
  - Engagement plan with the minister so there is "expert involvement" in education planning

<sup>3</sup> Student teachers in Australia can get between \$140 to \$420 per day on practicum: https://www.vic.gov.au/pre-service-teacher-placement-grants-program

- There needs to be a new way to evaluate the required teacher pay and conditions to determine teacher pay. The current industrial pay negotiations process does not work; a better mechanism is needed to achieve solution
- Working with other unions (health in particular) to make sure not being pitted against each other.

# **Preparation and Education**

There are many stakeholders involved in this middle phase of the teacher supply conundrum that focuses on the preparation of the workforce. There are over 20 initial teacher education providers across early childhood, primary and secondary settings, meeting the needs of different groups of aspiring teachers to staff over 2,500 schools and even more early childhood centres. Given this number of different teaching and learning contexts, it is not surprising that the challenges, solutions and conditions needed to support those conditions are also numerous and interwoven.

## Challenges

- A lack of cohesion in workforce planning for the education sector
  - limited understanding of the ITE pipeline (up to 3 years ITE + 2 years of induction and mentoring)
  - Multiple ITE providers feeding into centres and schools offering different programmes with varied expectations
  - danger of de-professionalising of teaching via apprenticeship- models; need for balanced programmes
  - O Tiriti-based coursework challenged by some practicum realities
  - O Lack of understanding of access to normal/model school funding support

#### Funding

- O Funding formulae inadequate under resourcing across the entire education pipeline (provider costs, student costs, AT/Mentor, release not met)
- O Lack of monetary support for student teachers
- Workforce support
  - Quality placement in secondary availability / payment.
- Diversity of ITE provisions
  - O Graduate teachers being able to work in language / culturally relevant places where available e.g. Samoan language / kura
  - Cultural competency expectations
  - O ITE pathways need to cater to a diverse range of Tauira
- Al and GAI digital advances create uncertainty

#### Solutions

- Address the lack of cohesion in workforce planning for the education sector through:
  - a Teacher Education Workforce strategy breaking down barriers between providers

- Professional development/ induction years dovetailing between ITE provider and schools in partnership
- Centralised Associate Teacher payment system rather than ITE individual contracted
- O We need data / TEC data heat maps to determine where School Onsite Training Programme (SOTP) is needed (place value, national, regional) across all sectors.
- O Connecting years 1-2 of PCTs with ITE methodology through mentoring
- Address funding challenges through
  - O Serious financial investment
  - Increase in teacher pay / financial support for students on practicum such as student teachers being allocated LAT-level funding for teaching practice in final year / 1 year course.
- Workforce support
  - O Funded staffing for associate/ mentor role
  - Teacher mentoring seen as a specialist skill remunerated / recognised
  - O Every teacher micro-credentialled as Associate/ Mentor teachers
  - O Strengthen availability of quality secondary placements. Teaching Council requirement for teachers to take student teachers.
  - O Increase the role that Normal and Model School Association play
  - O All schools who take students should have a focus on ITE
- Diversity of ITE provisions
  - O Increase indigenisation of content and pedagogy
  - O Flexible ITE pathways and alternative entry pathways/graduate pathways
- Continue to develop competency of ITE programmes and PLD (AI and GAI challenge) to address uncertainty

#### Conditions needed to achieve solutions

- Cohesion in workforce planning for the education sector:
  - O understanding the process for being/becoming an associate teacher
  - Centres and schools who value their mentoring role in the teacher preparation process
  - O Strong intentional connections between ITE and schools/centres
- Funding
  - O Actually do it e.g. support students on practicum; increase salaries/ benefits
  - Resources for partnerships to create cohesive alignment between ITE, Education sectors, and PLD, e.g.: need support for maths learning in ITE programmes to assist end of qualification achievement.
- Workforce support
  - All ITE providers to support Tauiwi students to understand and appreciate the impact of their positionalities (including biases) rather than asking Māori to answer everything
  - O Expand bonding to all teacher education students

## Retention

The difficulty retaining teachers in the profession is largely due to the increasing difficulty of the role, and the increased responsibility as a teacher progresses not being met with increased remuneration, career progression and enrichment. Other working conditions, especially teacher:ākonga ratios and insufficient non-contact time are inadequate.

The value society ascribes to the profession is dropping. There is also a decreased understanding of the reality of the role of teaching and the critical place it holds in society. This coupled with successive governments undervaluing the profession through lack of investment and increasing control over the profession, is resulting in less agency, autonomy and attraction for the profession. Constant policy upheavals likewise lead to uncertainty and inefficiencies

## Challenges

- Low status of teaching profession (societal value dropping)
- Profession undermined and underpaid by Government
- Remuneration low, pay equity required
- Inadequate working conditions
- Changing role and unrealistic expectations of teachers
- Lack of clear career progression
- Lack of career enrichment, sabbatical options
- Aging profession

#### Solutions

- Ability to move through salary steps faster, eg in line with Lawyers. Gen Z and millennials change career every 7yrs on average
- Society & Government to value the profession and teacher expertise
- Mindset shift of education as 'not cost, but investment'
- Resourcing education and teaching as a human right
- T:S ratio to 1:20
- Increase non-contact time
- Teacher (ākonga) assistant/aide in every classroom
- Specialist support service for teachers and ākonga
- Society & Government expands understanding of changing job description/role, 'multidisciplinary'.
- Job sizing
- Growing understanding that the education system includes teachers, specialists, support staff, parents, whānau, iwi, hapū
- Equitable PLD
- Opportunities for career progression and career enrichment
- Increased sabbaticals & scholarships
- Supportive return pathways for unregistered teachers
- Established pool of part time & relief teachers who also receive paid PLD

## Conditions needed to achieve solutions

- Funded career pathways to leadership
- Long term govt and multi-partisan commitment to increased investment

- Ending education as a political football
- Profession taking back control of narrative
- Multi-partisan agreement for profession-led education system Long term solutions and plans that avoid big upheavals with changes of government which compound already large teacher workloads
- Professional autonomy and agency
- Pay equity role sized to comparable professions, remuneration adjusted
- Public advocacy campaigns valuing and understanding profession

# Appendix 1

# **Summit Attendees**

1	NZEI Te Riu Roa	Mark Potter - President Jessie Moss - Professional Adviser Kaye Tester - Member, Principals Council rep Skye Barbour - New educator member rep, ECE ITE
2	PPTA Te Wehengarua	Chris Abercrombie, elected member President Alan Liddle, Secondary Principals' Council rep Joseph Durkin-Gorman - member, PCT rep Dr. Adele Scott - Advisory Officer, Professional Rob Willetts - Advisory Officer, Data
3	Council of Education Deans	Prof. Alison Kearney (Chair) - Massey Uni Claire McLachland - Pro Vice Chancellor Education, Waikato Prof. Sally Peters - Waikato uni ITE programme
4	TEFANZ	Dr Hiria McRae - Associate Dean (Teacher Education), Te Herenga Waka Kylie Smith - Head Ed Manukau IT Dr Helen Trevethan - Senior Lecturer, Otago University Dr. Judith Donaldson - Massey University Programme Coordinator Dr. Jared Carpendale - Senior Lecturer Massey University
5	Te Akatea	Bruce Jepson - president Therese Ford - co-facilitator of summit Maria Sheridan - co-facilitator of summit Logann Russell - rangatahi member, primary teacher Connor Baird - rangatahi member, secondary teacher
6	NZPF	Leanne Otene - President Liz Hawes
7	SPANZ	Louise Anaru - Principal Kaitaia College, SPANZ vice president Vickie Barrie, Principal Northcote college, SPANZ Exec
8	NZ Kindergartens	Jill Bond Norma Roberts - GM Professional Practice, Hutt City Kindergarten Association
9	Montessori Aotearoa NZ	Cathy Wilson

10	Te Herenga Waka	Prof. Carmen Dalli - Acting Dean of Education MacKenzie Valgre - Student teacher, secondary
11	Te Rito Maioha	Kathy Wolfe - Catherine Bell - Erin Keyworth -
12	NMANZ	Simon Clarke Andrew Bird
13	Teachers Council	Pauline Barnes Clive Jones
14	Otago University College of Education	Naomi Ingram Helen Trevethan
15	Bethlehem Tertiary Institute	Linda Brown
16	AUT	Dr. Adrian Schoone - Acting Head of School of Education Dr. Esther Fitzpatrick, Acting Associate Dean Head of Initial Teacher Education
17	MoE Education Workforce team	Zak Sutton Michael Tilyard Kiri Batty
18	NZSTA	Lorraine Kerr
	Invited but did not attend	Te Kōhanga Reo National Trust, Ngā Kura ā-iwi, NZCER, Te Rūnanga nui o ngā Kura Kaupapa Māori, NZQA, ERO

# Future wānanga - consideration of who else should be in the room

- iwi and hapū
- re-invite Ngā Kura ā-lwi, Te Runanga nui o Ngā Kura Kaupapa, Kōhanga Reo National trust, NZQA
- Independent schools
- Those who have left the profession
- MBIE / media
- Politicians
- Treasury

Others – NZQA / ERO

#### Appendix 2 Media

Media were invited to the NZEI offices to film and interview delegates at the Summit.

See here for some of the media from the Summit:

Newsroom article
NZEI Te Riu Roa media release
PPTA media release

A subsequent <u>TVNZ</u> news item on the summit had a heavy primary-focus. It would be very helpful to have all the education sector groups from early childhood through to tertiary reflecting in the media, and with politicians, that the solutions to the very real problem are, most immediately, pay and conditions.

## Press release, Tuesday 3 September from attendees at the Teacher Supply Summit

Nineteen Education Sector Groups met on the 2nd to 3rd September to discuss teacher supply in Aotearoa New Zealand. The group comprises peak education bodies including teacher education providers, professional bodies and unions as well as representatives of students and beginning teachers.

The right of every child to a quality public education is dependent on a high-quality teaching workforce. The Education Sector Groups agreed there is a chronic and critical shortage of teachers across the early childhood, primary and secondary sectors, and there is an immediate need to find a systemic solution to prevent further attrition.

The supply of teachers in Aotearoa is jeopardised by a variety of factors. School and centre leaders have been warning for many years that the number of successful teachers entering teaching is in decline, with recent research by the Teaching Council of Aotearoa New Zealand showing that 58% of teachers are likely to leave the teaching profession in the next five years.

The Education Sector Groups agreed to formulate solutions for the challenges of teacher supply. The group will be designing innovations with a focus on recruitment, education, and retention. The solutions will require a focus on remuneration, working conditions and raising the status of the teaching profession.

The Education Sector Groups are calling for a stop to Education being used as a political football; a stop to the sheer volume of change without appropriate consultation; and a stop to attacks on the unique Aotearoa education context which is underpinned by Te Tiriti o Waitangi.

The Education Sector Groups will be compiling a coherent set of solutions to enhance the teaching profession, replace the current piecemeal approach, and create a sustainable workforce. These solutions will define foundational values and priorities for a cohesive and informed development of the supply of teachers for decision makers now and in the future.